Applied Government Name\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  
Citizenship Test Harkness Packet   
Mr. Faulhaber Class Period: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

**Handout 1: Background Materials: Read and Highlight/Underline the assigned Articles**(Ask about any terms that are unclear.)

# R.I. sued over lack of civics education in schools

**By**[**Linda Borg**](mailto:lborg@providencejournal.com)**, Providence Journal Staff Writer**Posted Dec 5, 2019 at 10:01 PM-----Updated Dec 5, 2019 at 10:21 PM

PROVIDENCE — In a lawsuit with national implications, a lawyer for a group of youth argued that Rhode Island students are being denied their constitutional rights to a robust civics education.

…The case, believed to be the first of its kind in the United States, names as defendants Gov. Gina Raimondo, the state Department of Education, the leaders of the General Assembly and the Council on Elementary and Secondary Education.

“Nothing is more deeply rooted in our democracy than preparing students to participate in that democracy,” Rebell told the court. “Education plays a fundamental role in maintaining the fabric of our society.”

Rhode Island, he said, is failing its students by not instructing them in the values needed to participate in a democratic society. Rebell said the state does not mandate civics, doesn’t train teachers in this subject, and does not measure students on their knowledge of civics.

…The arguments revolved around a 1973 case before the U.S. Supreme Court in which students from a poor school district in Texas argued that they were denied the right to an adequate education.

The Rhode Island Department of Education, represented by Anthony Cottone, argued that the high court, in ruling against the Texas students, found that there is no constitutional right to an education.

…Cottone also argued that teaching civics falls squarely within the purview of the state department of education and local school districts.

Pointing to the fallout from Brown vs. the Board of Education, the landmark desegregation case, Cottone said that if the federal courts got involved in mandating civics education, school districts would be embroiled in years of litigation.

Smith, quoting Gordon Wood, a retired Brown University historian, questioned whether the democratic experiment would survive without an educated citizenry. “In a democracy like ours, if only 15 percent [of students] can distinguish between what is fact and what is fiction, can one say something has failed?”

…Smith asked whether this matter would better be handled by Congress or the individual states.

Rebell countered that the federal court is the last resort for the state of Rhode Island.

“Civic education in this state is a disaster and we need to have it cleaned up,” he said.

Only 23 percent of Rhode Island students passed the civics test on the National Assessment of Educational Progress, a national test known as the Nation’s Report Card, Rebell said.

In a news conference after oral arguments, several Providence students described the power of hearing these arguments in court.

“It was my first time in court and it was really great,” said Symone Burrell. “What concerned me was that the lawyers who work for the Rhode Island Department of Education were saying that education is not a right and they kept repeating it. It’s kind of scary that people responsible for running our education believe that.”

Another student, Jayson Rodriguez, said the experience underscored his desire to become a lawyer.  
  
“Every student should have an experience like this,” he said. “At the end when they said, ’All rise,” I was like, ‘do we leave now?’ I wasn’t educated on how the court system works.”

**Civics Education Bills Are on Legislative Agendas in Seven States**  
*By Guest Blogger Sasha Jones*

While most states require students to study civics in some sort of capacity, just eight mandate a yearlong civics or government class as a graduation requirement, [**according to a 2018 50-state survey**](https://www.edweek.org/ew/section/multimedia/data-most-states-require-history-but-not.html) by *Education Week*.

But that number may soon grow as a flurry of civics education bills inch through state legislatures this year and other states move to expand or implement civic education requirements already in place. *Education Week*'s survey last year found three states—Washington, Nevada and Pennsylvania—that are already on board to begin expanding their civics requirements as soon as this year.

Seven other states are set to consider civics education bills introduced since the new year began.

Although the way that civics is covered in schools—[**and what is included**](http://www.edweek.org/ew/projects/how-history-class-divides-us.html)—varies from state to state, the most common approach is the Joe Foss Institute's Civics Education Initiative, which calls for high school students to pass the 100-question test required to acquire U.S. citizenship.

With a 38 to 31 vote, the South Dakota House of Representatives [**passed a bill**](http://sdlegislature.gov/Legislative_Session/Bills/Bill.aspx?Bill=1066&Session=2019) in that would require high school students to take that test, and score at least a 70 percent, to graduate. Although the Senate has since deferred the bill, if it passes, testing would start in the 2019-20 school year.

Indiana lawmakers have introduced [**a similar bill**](http://iga.in.gov/legislative/2019/bills/senate/132#digest-heading) in their Senate, which would make the civics exam a requirement starting in the 2020-21 school year if it's approved.

Although Tennessee already requires that students take a civics exam, [**a new bill**](http://wapp.capitol.tn.gov/apps/BillInfo/Default.aspx?BillNumber=SB1243) is calling for the exam to be expanded from 25-50 questions to 100. Additionally, students would have to answer 75 percent—instead of 70 percent—of the questions correctly to graduate.

Some states are going beyond the citizenship test to implement legislation that could potentially affect more specific curriculum changes.

In Minnesota, state representatives have [**drafted legislation**](https://www.revisor.mn.gov/bills/bill.php?b=Senate&f=SF0294&ssn=0&y=2019) that would require juniors or seniors to take a for-credit civics class as part of the three-and-a-half social studies credits they are currently required to earn in high schools.

Although the state [**already requires**](http://kduz.com/2019/02/27/urdahl-nelson-author-legislation-addressing-crisis-in-civics-knowledge/) that students take a 50-question civics test, the exam is not currently a graduation requirement. The Minnesota Department of Education will, however, use data from the current exam to assess students' civics knowledge.

A bill that would add civic responsibility to middle and high school curricula [**in North Carolina**](https://www.ncleg.gov/BillLookUp/2019/H73) is currently working through the state's House of Representatives. While it is uncertain what the final requirements would consist of, the bill says that instruction would focus on respect for school personnel, responsibility for school safety, service to others, and good citizenship.

In Nebraska, [**a bill**](https://nebraskalegislature.gov/bills/view_bill.php?DocumentID=36793) to change the name and provisions related to the Committee on Americanism to the Committee on American Civics would also shape education as the new committee would review and approve social studies curricula to stress civics and government. The current proposed bill also states that the curriculum would incorporate "multicultural education."

Additionally, California has stated its intent to enact future legislation related to civics education in a [**February assembly bill**](https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/billTextClient.xhtml?bill_id=201920200AB1787). (The state already requires students to take a one-semester civics and government class in order to graduate from high school.)

On the federal level, Senators Jim Inhofe (R-Okla.), Angus King (I-Maine), and Chris Coons (D-Del.) introduced the [**Constitution Education Is Valuable in Community Schools (CIVICS) Act of 2019**](https://www.congress.gov/bill/116th-congress/senate-bill/313?s=1&r=35) to Congress, which would aim to "improve the quality of student achievement in, and teaching of, American history, civics, government, or geography in elementary and secondary schools," as well as educate students about the history and principles of the Constitution and Bill of Rights.

**Deliberating Question**

“Should Montana require students to pass the U.S. Citizenship Test, fulfill community service hours, or a combination of both in order to graduate high school in order to emphasize its importance in our society to demonstrate civic competency of students?”

**Handout 2—Practice: Complete the following citizenship test and evaluate your proficiency**(extra credit: have one or both of your parent(s), guardian(s), adults in your life take the test with you asking the questions and evaluating their scores (no reason to turn in the scores to embarrass you parent-just acknowledge you did so)

COULD *YOU* PASS THE CITIZENSHIP TEST

*An Attempt to summarize the basic concepts of American democracy*

For many naysayers, the process of becoming a citizen is too easy. Applicants, they believe, should know more about American history and how our government operates. Approximately ten years ago, on October 1, 2009 this is, in fact, what occurred. The citizenship test got much more difficult and required would be citizens to pass an exam consisting of 100 civics (history and government) questions. The civics test is an oral test in which the applicant must answer 6 out of 10 questions correctly to pass the civics portion of the naturalization test.

In addition to passing a reading and writing test of English proficiency, all immigrants going through the naturalization process must pass this new civics exam that some say is much harder than the test it replaced.

Now it’s your turn. Do you think you have what it takes to earn American citizenship? Try answering the following 50 questions I have selected from the new test and see if you have the knowledge required to become an American citizen (it takes a minimum of 30 correct responses to pass). If so, congratulations for paying attention in your social science classes and keep up the good work this coming year. If not, consider yourself lucky you were born here but beware, many states are starting to require passage of this test to graduate!

1. What is the supreme law of the land?

2. The idea of self-government is in the first three words of the Constitution. What are these words?

3. What do we call the first ten amendments to the Constitution?

4. What is one right or freedom from the First Amendment?

5. How many amendments does the Constitution have?

6. What are two rights in the Declaration of Independence?

7. What is the economic system in the United States?

8. Name one branch or part of the government.

9. What stops one branch of government from becoming too powerful?

10. Who is in charge of the executive branch?

11. What are the two parts of the U.S. Congress?

12. How many U.S. Senators are there?

13. We elect a U.S. Senator for how many years?

14. Who is one of your state’s U.S. Senators now?

15. The House of Representatives has how many voting members?

16. We elect a U.S. Representative for how many years?

17. Name your U.S. Representative.

18. We elect a President for how many years?

19. What is the name of the President of the United States now?

20. What is the name of the Vice President of the United States now?

21. If both the President and the Vice President can no longer serve, who becomes President?

22. How many justices are on the Supreme Court?

23. Who is the Chief Justice of the United States now?

24. Who is the Governor of your state now?

25. What is the capital of your state?

26. What are the two major political parties in the United States?

27. How old do citizens have to be to vote for President?

28. Who lived in America before the Europeans arrived?

29. Who wrote the Declaration of Independence?

30. When was the Declaration of Independence adopted?

31. There were 13 original states. Name three.

32. When was the Constitution written?

33. Who is the “Father of Our Country”?

34. Who was the first President?

35. What territory did the United States buy from France in 1803?

36. Name one war fought by the United States in the 1800s.

37. Name one war fought by the United States in the 1900s.

38. Who was President during World War I?

39. Who was President during the Great Depression and World War II?

40. Who did the United States fight in World War II?

41. During the Cold War, what was the main concern of the United States?

42. Name one of the two longest rivers in the United States.

43. What ocean is on the West Coast of the United States?

44. Name one U.S. territory.

45. Name one state that borders Mexico.

46. What is the capital of the United States?

47. Where is the Statue of Liberty?

48. Why does the flag have 13 stripes?

49. Why does the flag have 50 stars?

50. What is the name of the national anthem?

**Handout 3: Compare-**Read the assigned Articles showing the performances on the questions you(loved ones) answered

**Poll explores whether Americans know enough to pass citizenship test**  
Sure, you can fire up a barbecue and set off fireworks. But as the Fourth of July weekend approaches, do you know enough about the United States to become a citizen?

A new survey by Ipsos Public Affairs tested more than 2,000 respondents on some of the questions included on the exam immigrants must pass as part of the process of gaining citizenship.

More than nine in 10 of those polled aced the question of the day, correctly identifying the date the Declaration of Independence was signed as July 4, 1776. Ninety percent or more knew that the Supreme Court is the highest court in the land, that the presidential election is held in November, and that the flag has 13 stripes to represent the original 13 colonies.

Close behind: More than eight in 10 correctly chose the Constitution as the supreme law of the land, *The Star Spangled Banner* as the national anthem and the Atlantic as the ocean along the East Coast — although another one in 10 misidentified it as the Pacific. Geography class, anyone?

After that, scores start sinking.

About two-thirds picked Paul Ryan as the current speaker of the House and Franklin Roosevelt as president during the Great Depression and World War II.

But only a bit more than a third, 36%, knew that Benjamin Franklin is famous to this day as a U.S. diplomat. Nearly as many, 27%, identified him as a writer of the Federalist Papers. (That would be Alexander Hamilton, James Madison and John Jay.)

“Contrary to popular opinion, Americans are not all about the Benjamins,” says Chris Jackson, vice president of Ipsos. “Most respondents were unable to answer the role Ben Franklin played as a founding father.”

Asked a random selection of five of the 10 possible questions, 35% of those surveyed scored a perfect five, which Ipsos graded as an “A.” Thirty-one percent missed just one question, getting a “B.” At the bottom of the class: 18% who got a “D” for getting three right. Sixteen percent failed, answering two or fewer questions correctly.

In terms of partisanship, Republicans outscored Democrats and independents. Forty percent of Republicans answered all five questions correctly, compared with 35% of independents and 33% of Democrats.

In the actual civics test administered by the U.S. Immigration and Citizenship Services, applicants are asked up to 10 questions chosen from a list of 100 about American history and government, and they must answer six correctly to pass. The official test is more difficult than the survey, however, because it doesn’t include multiple-choice answers.

In the poll, 57% said correctly that the Supreme Court has nine justices, but the 18% who said the correct answer is eight might have grounds to dispute being marked down — at least until a replacement is confirmed for the late Justice Antonin Scalia.   
  
The online survey of 2,010 adults, taken Monday through Wednesday, has a credibility interval (akin to a margin of error) of plus or minus 2.5 percentage points.

**Poll shows how citizenship questions stump many**

1. In the U.S., what is the supreme law of the land?  
**The Constitution: 84%**  
The Declaration of Independence: 11%  
The Emancipation Proclamation: 3%  
The Articles of Confederation: 2%

2. In America, what do we call the first 10 amendments to the Constitution?  
**The Bill of Rights: 79%**  
The Declaration of Independence: 16%  
The Voting Rights Act: 3%  
The Magna Carta: 3%

3. What is the economic system in the United States?  
**Capitalist Economy: 75%**  
Natural Economy: 11%  
Socialist Economy: 9%  
Digital Economy: 4%

4. In America, a U.S. senator is elected for how many years?  
**Six: 45%**  
Four: 29%  
Two: 22%  
Five: 4%

5. In the United States, during what month do citizens vote for president?  
**November: 90%**  
October: 4%  
July: 4%  
January: 2%

6. What is the highest court in the United States?  
**The Supreme Court: 94%**  
Court of Appeals: 3%  
Tax Court: 2%  
District Courts: 2%

7. When was the Declaration of Independence adopted in America?  
**July 4, 1776: 91%**  
November 25, 1783: 4%  
March 31, 1774: 3%  
July 8, 1791: 2%

8. What is one thing that Benjamin Franklin is famous for to this day?  
**U.S. diplomat: 36%**  
Writer of the Federalist Papers: 27%  
Founder of the United States financial system: 19%  
U.S. president: 17%

9. What did the Emancipation Proclamation do for Americans?  
**Free the slaves: 78%**  
Promote the Constitution to the American public: 11%  
End the war of 1812: 8%  
Relocate native Americans to federal territory: 3%

10. Who was the American president during the Great Depression and World War II?  
**Franklin Roosevelt: 69%**  
Theodore Roosevelt: 18%  
Woodrow Wilson: 8%  
Calvin Coolidge: 4%

11. What ocean is on the East Coast of the United States?  
**Atlantic (Ocean): 84%**  
Pacific (Ocean): 10%  
Southern (Ocean): 4%  
Indian (Ocean): 2%

12. Why does the flag have 13 stripes?  
**To represent the 13 original colonies: 90%**  
To represent the 13 famous battles in the American revolutionary war: 6%  
To represent the 13 original constitutional congress delegates: 4%

13. What is the name of the American national anthem?  
**The Star-Spangled Banner: 87%**  
America the Beautiful: 6%  
My Country, ‘Tis of Thee: 4%  
The Liberty Song: 3%

14. How many justices are on the American Supreme Court?  
**Nine: 57%**  
Eight: 18%  
Eleven: 12%  
Seven: 12%

15. What is the name of the current speaker of the House of Representatives in the United States?  
**Paul D. Ryan: 64%**  
John Boehner: 18%  
John Kerry: 9%  
Mitch McConnell: 9%

**Handout 4: Prepare-**Read and Highlight/Underline the assigned Articles

**Require citizenship test in schools:   
The exam can provide a floor on civics learning. It doesn't have to set the ceiling.** 

Jay Leno's old *Tonight Show* man-on-the-street quizzes were particularly hilarious — and depressing — when he [tested Americans' knowledge](http://www.dailymotion.com/video/xf0a2u_jay-walking-citizens-show-no-knowle_news) of their own government.

One woman thought the colonies won their independence from Greece; a college instructor guessed that U.S. independence was won in 1922; and a man said the general who led our troops in the Revolutionary War was Winston Churchill.

Funny stuff, until you remember that these are the same citizens who elect the leaders who shape the nation's future, if they bother to vote at all. Nor are these know-nothings outliers.

Surveys and tests repeatedly show that Americans' knowledge of civics is pathetic. In 2010, just one in five eighth-graders tested [proficient in civics](http://www.nationsreportcard.gov/civics_2010/g8_national.aspx?tab_id=tab2&subtab_id=Tab_1#chart) on a national performance assessment — worse even than their dismal performance in reading and math.

A [poll of Millennials](http://fusion.net/story/41972/fusion-poll-millennials-politics-hillary-clinton-jeb-bush-election-2016/), out last week, found that 77% of these 18- to 34-year-olds could not name even one of their home state's U.S. senators.

A 2012 survey of adults by Xavier University found that [one in three native-born citizens](http://www.xavier.edu/americandream/programs/National-Civic-Literacy-Survey.cfm) failed the civics portion of a test given to immigrants seeking U.S. citizenship. The pass rate for immigrants: 97.5%.

So a decision last month by Arizona and North Dakota to [require high school students](http://www.washingtonpost.com/blogs/govbeat/wp/2015/02/02/north-dakota-is-second-state-to-require-high-school-students-to-pass-a-civics-test-to-graduate/) to pass that same 100-question test to graduate is a welcome acknowledgment of the problem.

Like just about everything else in education, however, their simple idea is becoming contentious. It is under attack as yet another test-prep intrusion on education that could prompt schools to dumb down civics education — if that's possible.

Students used to master the basic workings of government in grade school. But in the past 20 years, civics has been eclipsed by a focus on reading, math and science, made even more intense by the No Child Left Behind law, which mandated annual tests in these subjects.

Fortunately, an eclectic group of leaders from government, education and the arts, including retired Supreme Court justice Sandra Day O'Connor, has championed a return to civics. They're making progress. Today, almost all states require civics classes in high school. About [half the states](http://www.civicyouth.org/maps/state-civic-ed/index.html) already test students on civics or social studies.

Arizona and North Dakota, the first states to introduce the citizenship exam to schools, are not among them, but they at least now have a tool teachers can use.

Some questions are easy or trivial. But many about voting, the First Amendment, states' rights and the Supreme Court offer jumping-off points for enticing discussions about current events. In the hands of a good teacher, they can make students realize how much the American system of government affects their lives. The test can provide a floor on civics learning. It doesn't have to set the ceiling.

When just 26% of Americans can [name the chief justice of the United States](http://www.xavier.edu/americandream/programs/documents/5CivicTestpowerpointfinalPDF.pdf), there's nowhere to go but up.  
  
***=****USA TODAY's editorial opinions are decided by its* [*Editorial Board*](http://www.usatoday.com/reporters/opinion.html)*, separate from the news staff.*

**Good citizenship transcends a test: It's not a matter of memorizing some random information.**



Requiring students to pass the citizenship exam will reduce both the amount and the quality of civic education in our schools.

The test is easy. You can see all the questions and answers in advance and just memorize the right choices.

If passing this exam comes to be seen as adequate preparation for citizenship, schools will notice that their students can pass after cramming for a couple of hours. They will cut their semester-long civics courses as unnecessary preparation. They will prefer to dedicate that semester to math or science, which involve much more sophisticated and challenging tests.

Requiring the citizenship exam would make sense if our students didn't already study civics or face tests. It would establish a floor, a minimal level of competence. But more than 90% of recent high school graduates have spent a semester in a civics course, and most have also spent a year on U.S. history. Their teachers gave them tests. [In many states](http://www.civicyouth.org/maps/state-civic-ed/index.html), they also faced a standardized test on civics or social studies.

Then why do so many adults fail basic questions about the U.S. political system? Because we have forgotten what we learned in civics class. Too often, the subject wasn't inspiring or challenging and didn't build habits of following and discussing the news.

The problem with civics is not that we fail to teach it. The problem is that civics is often viewed as a set of disconnected facts, not as a challenging and inspiring subject that will continue to interest us after high school.

Arizona's measure requiring that students pass the citizenship test will make that problem worse. The citizenship exam requires, for instance, that you know that "[27](http://www.archives.gov/exhibits/charters/constitution_amendments_11-27.html)" is the correct answer when you're asked how many constitutional amendments have been passed. You don't need to understand reasons for or against those amendments, or have any sense of why they were important.

A month after students pass this test, they will forget the number 27. But they might retain the message that being a good citizen is a matter of memorizing some random information. That seems like an excellent way to turn people off.

*Peter Levine is associate dean for research at Tufts University's Jonathan M. Tisch College of Citizenship and Public Service.*

[EDUCATION, K-12](https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/view/):  **Should High School Students be Required to Complete Community Service Hours Before they Graduate?**  
  
The State of Civics Education By Sarah Shapiro and [Catherine Brown](https://www.americanprogress.org/about/staff/brown-catherine/bio/)  February 21, 2018, 7:00 am



Getty/Spencer WeinerA student searches for India on the classroom globe in Ojai, California, February 2005.

Civic knowledge and public engagement is at an all-time low. A 2016 survey by the Annenberg Public Policy Center found that only 26 percent of Americans can name all three branches of government, which was a significant decline from previous years.[1](https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2018/02/21/446857/state-civics-education/#fn-446857-1) Not surprisingly, public trust in government is at only 18 percent[2](https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2018/02/21/446857/state-civics-education/#fn-446857-2) and voter participation has reached its lowest point since 1996.[3](https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2018/02/21/446857/state-civics-education/#fn-446857-3) Without an understanding of the structure of government; rights and responsibilities; and methods of public engagement, civic literacy and voter apathy will continue to plague American democracy. Educators and schools have a unique opportunity and responsibility to ensure that young people become engaged and knowledgeable citizens.

While the 2016 election brought a renewed interest in engagement among youth,[4](https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2018/02/21/446857/state-civics-education/#fn-446857-4) only 23 percent of eighth-graders performed at or above the proficient level on the National Assessment of Educational Progress (NAEP) civics exam, and achievement levels have virtually stagnated since 1998.[5](https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2018/02/21/446857/state-civics-education/#fn-446857-5) In addition, the increased focus on math and reading in K-12 education—while critical to prepare all students for success—has pushed out civics and other important subjects.

The policy solution that has garnered the most momentum to improve civics in recent years is a standard that requires high school students to pass the U.S. citizenship exam before graduation.[6](https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2018/02/21/446857/state-civics-education/#fn-446857-6) According to this analysis, 17 states have taken this path.[7](https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2018/02/21/446857/state-civics-education/#fn-446857-7) Yet, critics of a mandatory civics exam argue that the citizenship test does nothing to measure comprehension of the material[8](https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2018/02/21/446857/state-civics-education/#fn-446857-8) and creates an additional barrier to high school graduation.[9](https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2018/02/21/446857/state-civics-education/#fn-446857-9) Other states have adopted civics as a requirement for high school graduation, provided teachers with detailed civics curricula, offered community service as a graduation requirement, and increased the availability of Advance Placement (AP) U.S. government classes.[10](https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2018/02/21/446857/state-civics-education/#fn-446857-10)

When civics education is taught effectively, it can equip students with the knowledge, skills, and disposition necessary to become informed and engaged citizens. Educators must also remember that civics is not synonymous with history. While increasing history courses and service requirements are potential steps to augment students’ background knowledge and skill sets, civics is a narrow and instrumental instruction that provides students with the agency to apply these skills. This analysis finds a wide variation in state requirements and levels of youth engagement. While this research highlights that no state currently provides sufficient and comprehensive civic education, there is reason to be optimistic that high-quality civics education can impact civic behavior.

### Key findings: Here is the current state of civics education…

1. **Only nine states and the District of Columbia require one year of U.S. government or civics.** Thirty-one states only require a half-year of civics or U.S. government education, and 10 states have no civics requirement.\* \*\* While federal education policy has focused on improving academic achievement in reading and math, this has come at the expense of a broader curriculum. Most states have dedicated insufficient class time to understanding the basic functions of government at the expense of other courses.[11](https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2018/02/21/446857/state-civics-education/#fn-446857-11)
2. **State civics curricula are heavy on knowledge but light on building skills and agency for civic engagement.**An examination of standards for civics and U.S. government courses found that 32 states and the District of Columbia provide instruction on American democracy and comparison to other systems of government; the history of the Constitution and Bill of Rights; an explanation of mechanisms for public participation; and instruction on state and local voting policies. However, no states have experiential learning or local problem-solving components in their civics requirements.[12](https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2018/02/21/446857/state-civics-education/#fn-446857-12)
3. **While almost half of states allow credit for community service, almost none require it.**[13](https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2018/02/21/446857/state-civics-education/#fn-446857-13) Only one state—Maryland—and the District of Columbia require both community service and civics courses for graduation.[14](https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2018/02/21/446857/state-civics-education/#fn-446857-14)
4. **Nationwide, students score very low on the AP U.S. government exam.** The national average AP U.S. government exam score is 2.64, which is lower than the average AP score of all but three of the other 45 AP exams offered by schools.[15](https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2018/02/21/446857/state-civics-education/#fn-446857-15) Most colleges require a score of 3.0 or higher and some require a score of 4.0 or higher to qualify for college credit. Only six states had a mean score of 3.0 or above and no states had a mean score of 4.0 or above on the AP U.S. government exam.[16](https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2018/02/21/446857/state-civics-education/#fn-446857-16)
5. **States with the highest rates of youth civic engagement tend to prioritize civics courses and AP U.S. government in their curricula.** The 10 states with the highest youth volunteer rates have a civics course requirement for graduation and score higher than average on the AP U.S. government exam. Seven out of 10 states with the highest youth voter participation rate score higher than average on the AP U.S. government exam.[17](https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2018/02/21/446857/state-civics-education/#fn-446857-17)

#### **… States with rigorous curricula**

While most states require a half-year of civics education, Colorado and Idaho designed detailed curricula that are taught throughout yearlong courses. In fact, Colorado’s only statewide graduation requirement is the satisfactory completion of a civics and government course.[18](https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2018/02/21/446857/state-civics-education/#fn-446857-18) Because all Colorado high schools must teach one year of civics, teachers are expected to cover the origins of democracy, the structure of American government, methods of public participation, a comparison to foreign governments, and the responsibilities of citizenship. The Colorado Department of Education also provides content, guiding questions, key skills, and vocabulary as guidance for teachers.

In addition, Colorado teachers help civics come alive in the classroom through the Judicially Speaking program, which was started by three local judges to teach students how judges think through civics as they make decisions.[19](https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2018/02/21/446857/state-civics-education/#fn-446857-19) As a recipient of the 2015 Sandra Day O’Connor Award for the Advancement of Civics Education, the Judicially Speaking program has used interactive exercises and firsthand experience to teach students about the judiciary. With the assistance of more than 100 judges and teachers, the program was integrated into the social studies curriculum statewide. Between a rigorous, yearlong course and the excitement of the Judicially Speaking program, Colorado’s civic education program may contribute to a youth voter participation rate[20](https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2018/02/21/446857/state-civics-education/#fn-446857-20) and youth volunteerism rate which is slightly higher than the national average.[21](https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2018/02/21/446857/state-civics-education/#fn-446857-21)

### Idaho has focused on introducing civics education in its schools at an early age. The state integrates a civics standard into every social studies class from kindergarten through 12th grade. While a formal civics course is not offered until high school, kindergarten students learn to “identify personal traits, such as courage, honesty, and responsibility” and third-graders learn to “explain how local government officials are chosen, e.g., election, appointment,” according to the Idaho State Department of Education’s social studies standards.[22](https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2018/02/21/446857/state-civics-education/#fn-446857-22) By the time students reach 12th grade, they are more prepared to learn civics-related topics, such as the electoral process and role of political parties; the methods of public participation; and the rights and responsibilities of citizenship, than students with no prior exposure to a civics curriculum. While Idaho does require a civics exam to graduate from high school, students have already had experience with the material through a mandatory civics course and are permitted to take the test until they pass.[23](https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2018/02/21/446857/state-civics-education/#fn-446857-23) … **Conclusion**

There are many policy levers for advancing civic education in schools, including civics or U.S. government courses; civics curricula closely aligned to state standards; community service requirements; instruction of AP U.S. government; and civics exams. While many states have implemented civics exams or civics courses as graduation requirements, these requirements often are not accompanied by resources to ensure that they are effectively implemented. Few states provide service-learning opportunities or engage students in relevant project-based learning. In addition, few students are sufficiently prepared to pass the AP U.S. government exam.

Moreover, low rates of Millennial voter participation and volunteerism indicate that schools have the opportunity to better prepare students to fulfill the responsibilities and privileges of citizenship. While this brief calls for increasing opportunities for U.S. government, civics, or service-learning education, these requirements are only as good as how they are taught. Service learning must go beyond an act of service to teach students to systemically address issues in their communities; civics exams must address critical thinking, in addition to comprehension of materials; and civics and government courses should prepare every student with the tools to become engaged and effective citizens.

Innovative efforts—such as Generation Citizen’s action civics programming and Judicially Speaking’s guest lectures from civics experts—have allowed for small changes to make a big impact on how teachers educate the next generation of leaders. While some highlighted examples have successfully reformed civics, more states, districts, and schools should invest in comprehensive and action-oriented civics curricula to build students’ capacity to become engaged and knowledgeable citizens.

Sarah Shapiro is a research assistant for K-12 Education at the Center for American Progress.  
more at <https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2018/02/21/446857/state-civics-education/>

**Handout 5—Harkness Prep**

**Directions**: From the articles you read and highlighted above, list **3** reasons in **EACH** option.

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Option 1: Reasons to Support the Citizenship Test Requirement | Option 1I: Reasons to Oppose the Citizenship Test Requirement | Option II: Reasons to Support Community Service Requirement |
| Reason 1:  Reason 2:    Reason 3: | Reason 1:  Reason 2:  Reason 3: | Reason 1:  Reason 2:  Reason 3: |

**If someone were to ask you the deliberating question right now, you would tell them… because…**\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

**When I asked my Parents/Guardians/Adult in my life the deliberation question, they told me....**\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ **Parents/Guardians/Adult in my life Initials:**   
  
  
**What sort of evidence could the other side of the argument introduce that might change my mind?** \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

**Handout 6: Deliberation Notes**

**Notes: Arguments presented in class, Who Said it, What did they Say (**if not present, what do your parents, peers, coworkers, etc. say about this issue)

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  
  
\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  
  
\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  
  
\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  
  
\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  
  
\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  
  
\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_  
  
\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

**Handout 7: Self Evaluation Rubric**

**DIRECTIONS: Read through each category and its criteria***. Complete either or both columns to give yourself an accurate grade.*   
  
In the LEFT column: Place a check plus next to those you completed in an exceptional manner, a check plus/check mark if it was only completed well, a check mark next to the criteria in which you completed okay, a check mark/check minus if it was completed okay but not great, a and a check minus that you completed but not very well, and place an X next to the criteria not completed at all.   
  
In the RIGHT column: Place the appropriate grade in the space to the immediate left of EACH criteria required by determining those areas you performed or were lacking and based upon the point value listed. Place a N/A or “not applicable next to any criterion not required for your specific role. Average the points together in place that score in the “your estimate” blank.   
 ***\*\*\*Remember, a perfect grade should reflect perfect work and only be used when the work done had no deficiencies & could not have been performed any better***.\*\*

* **PREPARATION AND RESEARCH (1-20):**

\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_**Read and Highlighted/Underlined the assigned articles**

\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Completed Prep Grid by putting 3 reasons in each Category  
\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Completed citizenship Test and took time responding and completed “extra credit”   
\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Reviewed Education Commission: 50 State Comparison Website: <http://ecs.force.com/mbdata/MBQuest2RTANW?Rep=CIP1601S>  
\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Talked with parent(s), guardian(s), and/or adult(s) in your life to gain a better understanding of the varying facets of the issue

\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_**Conducted research on your own based upon the questions you still have to be effective in deliberation**   
\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Attached and turned in Research Notes with rubric and other documents **Your Average** \_\_\_\_\_\_/20

* **CONTENT COVERED/PERSUASIVENESS/PARTICIPATION/OVERALL PERFORMANCE (1-10):**

\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Clearly outlined your position on the question proposed Arguments generated employed insight of the issue

\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Used Logos: **Cited verifiable facts and** used data/evidence to prove one’s case

\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Got material across in a way that was informative and easily understood

\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Demonstrated Ethos: ability to establish credibility through a strong grasp of principles involved

\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Use of anecdotes was to reinforce NOT as sole rationale for position

\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Pathos: or emotion was used appropriately and not primary focus   
\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Did not propagate lies or false truths and your peers are generally smarter for your participation  
\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Did not simply echo the thoughts of others or make irrelevant comments

\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Utilized ***clarification*** questions to gain information

\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_When asked a question, showed ability to think on feet providing clear main arguments to original posit

\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Was a **Frequent** Participant **but** did not hog the conversation   
\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Performed to the best of your abilities and was an attribute, not detriment to this simulation  
\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Felt good about my performance afterward and my role in the Harkness  
 **Your Average** \_\_\_\_\_\_/10

* **RESPECTFUL/RESPONSIBLE BEHAVIOR (1-05):**

\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Professional and Attentively listened by looking at speakers

\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Followed proceedings- taking notes when necessary **(Attach your notes to this self-evaluation)**

\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Was Respectful to Peers both verbally and through mannerisms; Avoided ad hominin attacks   
\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Let others speak before we spoke again **(general rule to follow: at least 3 people spoke before I spoke again)**

\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Did not interrupt peers or tell them “they could not argue that”

\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Had a positive Attitude during Harkness and Played Well with Others

**Your Average** \_\_\_\_\_\_/05

* **REFLECTION AND SELF-EVALUATION (1-05):**

\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Read and followed direction when completing rubric: Placed the appropriate mark next to EACH category  
\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Did not just use whole numbers and only gave yourself a 10 if your performance was PEFERCT and a model for future classes  
\_\_\_\_\_ \_\_\_\_\_Answered reflection questions with MINIMALLY three sentences for each question   
 **Your Average** \_\_\_\_\_\_/05  
 **TOTAL\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_/40**

**Handout 8: Reflection**

**REFLECTION QUESTIONS:** Learning involves some permanency. The discussion need needs legs. After the Harkness and completing your self-evaluation, re-cap the conversation with your parent(s), guardian(s), adult(s) in your life about what you heard and reflect deeply on what was discussed  **Answer each question and return with your rubric.**   
QUESTION #1. What was your (loved ones) initial thoughts on the subject and question? How has that opinion evolved and/or become more nuanced?

QUESTION #2. List and describe (1-2 Sentences Each) the three most meaningful ideas, concepts, and/or principles learned through this project.

QUESTION #3. Explain what you did well on the project. Explain what could you could have done differently and would change if you were to complete this project again?

QUESTION #4. What did you like and dislike about the Harkness? What can be done to improve the process to make it more meaningful i.e. more time, rubric changes, (for example, is point value/score for this activity, criterion required, were the point values in each section reasonable), fewer links or more links/info to research, etc.? How would you rank the value of the project (1-10)? Justify the ranking.

QUESTION #5. **OVERALL PERFORMANCE:** How would you rate your project (1-10) based upon your preparation, knowledge and understanding of the issue, and performance in regards to your prior projects and your peers? Justify the ranking. Did the rubric give you the correct grade? Explain. If the overall score determined through the rubric is different from the grade you believe you deserve explain why and the grade you believe is warranted.